PUMPKIN
The Curious History of an American Icon
CINDY OTT
FOREWORD BY WILLIAM CRONON
Weyerhaeuser Environmental Books
William Cronon, Editor

Weyerhaeuser Environmental Books explore human relationships with natural environments in all their variety and complexity. They seek to cast new light on the ways that natural systems affect human communities, the ways that people affect the environments of which they are a part, and the ways that different cultural conceptions of nature profoundly shape our sense of the world around us. A complete list of the books in the series appears at the end of this book.
CONTENTS

Foreword: Not by Bread Alone, by William Cronon  vii
Acknowledgments  xiii
Introduction  3

1 CORN, BEANS, AND JUST ANOTHER SQUASH  9
10,000 BCE to 1600

2 “THE TIMES WHEREIN OLD POMPION WAS A SAINT”  32
From Pumpkin Beer to Pumpkin Pie, 1600 to 1799

3 THOREAU SITS ON A PUMPKIN  57
The Making of a Rural New England Icon, 1800 to 1860

4 “WONDERFULLY GRAND AND COLOSSAL”  85
The Pumpkin and the Nation, 1861 to 1899

5 JACK-O’-LANTERN SMILES  112
Americans Celebrate the Fall Harvest with Pumpkins, 1900 to 1945

6 ATLANTIC GIANTS TO JACK-BE-LITTLES  139
The Changing Nature of Pumpkins, 1946 to the Present

7 PULLING UP A PIG STY TO PUT IN A PUMPKIN PATCH  165
The Changing Nature of American Rural Economies, 1946 to the Present

Notes  199
Bibliography  269
Index  309
The best works of history often encourage us to revisit familiar times, places, people, and things in ways that help us see the past and even the world today with entirely new eyes. Edmund Morgan’s classic *American Slavery, American Freedom* directed our attention to the paradox that the Declaration of Independence—which has served as a symbolic beacon of freedom and democracy from the moment Thomas Jefferson first drafted it—was in large measure the creation of wealthy Virginians whose lives were utterly dependent on the profoundly unfree and undemocratic institution of slavery. In Morgan’s hands, this surprising fact became a means for understanding not just the American Revolution, but the contradictions of race and class that have bedeviled the United States since before its founding. In a very different but no less revelatory way, Dava Sobel’s little volume on *Longitude* asked readers to take a closer look at the north-south east-west lines we see every time we encounter a map or a globe in an effort to help us recognize the practical and mathematical challenges those lines have historically posed for navigation. From that small beginning, she tells an unforgettable tale about mariners on the high seas who found it nearly impossible to determine their east-west position until an eighteenth-century English inventor finally devised a clock that didn’t lose time even after many weeks at sea. The world we inhabit is filled with things like these that we typically take utterly for granted. Only when we ask how they came to be—only when we inquire about their histories—do we recognize how strange and wondrous they truly are.

In the book you now hold in your hands, Cindy Ott performs just such a minor historical miracle with a plant you’ve probably known your entire
life without giving it a second thought. *Pumpkin: The Curious History of an American Icon* takes a long, close look at this colorful American vegetable—though, in truth, those misshapen orange globes with stems are really fruits—and by so doing reveals just what a quirky and surprising role it has played in the cultural history of the United States.

Pause for a minute to reflect on the moments in a typical year when your own life intersects with that of the pumpkin. Sometime in October, especially if there are children in your household, someone will likely make a trip to the local grocery store or perhaps to a farm in the surrounding countryside to purchase some of these large orange vegetables. Back at home, the family will cut them open, scoop out their seeds, and with varying degrees of artistry carve faces on their sides which, come Halloween, will welcome trick-or-treaters to the front door by flickering candlelight. Then, a few weeks later, someone will purchase cans of pumpkin from a large display at the local supermarket—which barely stocks the stuff during the rest of the year—in order to serve pumpkin pie at the traditional Thanksgiving feast. The same ritual might possibly be repeated at Christmas if your family is especially fond of this seasonal dessert, but in most households, no one will see or eat such a pie until another year has passed.

For millions of American families, these seasonal appearances of the pumpkin are so familiar that they seem almost natural, which is no doubt why we rarely give them much thought. It takes a scholar of unusual wit and insight to step back from these seemingly timeless American rituals to ask, “But . . . isn’t this strange? Why would such an attractive and productive vegetable—a plant that in other parts of the world is often consumed year round—be relegated to just two annual appearances in American households, one of them not culinary at all? When did people in this country start doing this, and how did this plant come to play such a peculiar role in American popular culture?” Once she poses these questions—and once the reader has grasped their full oddity—it’s hard not to keep reading in spite of oneself. Pumpkin stories begin pouring forth so abundantly from Ott’s pages that they rival the plant itself in their fecundity. Read this book, and you’ll never see pumpkins in quite the same way again.

Let me offer just a few hors d’oeuvres for the intellectual feast that lies ahead. We all know that the reason pumpkin pie plays such an important role at Thanksgiving is that the Pilgrims and their Wampanoag neighbors dined on it when they gathered in Plymouth, Massachusetts, for a harvest
celebration that has ever since been ritually reenacted on the fourth Thursday in November. Unfortunately, what we all “know” turns out to be wrong in most of its particulars. Harvest celebrations like this one have ancient antecedents on both sides of the Atlantic, so this kind of gathering hardly originated at Plymouth. Furthermore, the idea of a special meal for the purpose of giving thanks emerged during the sixteenth century as a feature of the English Reformation, in which Days of Feasting and Days of Thanksgiving were meant to honor special acts of divine providence—and also to replace what Protestants saw as the too-frequent celebrations that typified the ritual calendar of the Catholic Church.

As for the Pilgrims, we have no idea of the date on which they held their feast, only that it took place sometime during the autumn of 1621. Thanksgiving celebrations began to be a regular feature of the New England calendar later in the seventeenth century, but not on any predictable date. By the early nineteenth century, different states chose different dates for these feasts, and not until 1863, in the midst of the Civil War, did Abraham Lincoln regularize the holiday as the final Thursday in November—a date that in 1941 Congress redefined as the fourth Thursday in November to anticipate those rare occasions when the month contains five Thursdays. (Canada celebrates its own version of Thanksgiving—which obviously has nothing to do with the Pilgrims—on the second Monday in October, though that particular date wasn’t finally resolved until 1957.)

Just as it took quite a while for Thanksgiving to migrate to its present place on the U.S. national calendar, so too did pumpkins take rather more time than we might imagine to find their way onto Thanksgiving menus. There are only two documents from Plymouth that make any mention at all of that first Thanksgiving celebration, and neither of them says a word about pumpkins. Although the pumpkin itself originated in the western hemisphere, it had made its way to Europe within three decades of Columbus’s first voyage—a full century before the Pilgrims landed in Massachusetts—and its distinctive appearance had already been depicted on a fresco in Rome by 1518. Ott notes that, much like the early American colonists, Europeans were quicker to recognize the visual appeal of this vegetable than they were its culinary possibilities, and her playful discussions of the diverse and changing roles pumpkins have played in European and American art are among the unexpected treats readers will discover in this book.

FOREWORD
Although we can be pretty sure that American colonists were eating pumpkin soon after they arrived here—it was too easy to grow and too prolific a source of food for them not to have done so—their failure to distinguish it from other gourds, squashes, and melons makes it hard for us to know for sure just how they prepared it. One thing we do know is that the dessert with which Americans now end their Thanksgiving meals would have been unrecognizable to the Pilgrims, whose ovens simply weren’t up to the task of making a modern pie crust. The first recipes we have for something akin to what we would today call pumpkin pie appear in French and English cookbooks during the second half of the seventeenth century, and probably migrated to the American colonies in the eighteenth century. Not until 1796, when Amelia Simmons wrote American Cookery, the first cookbook published in the new United States, did recipes for sweetened “pompkin” baked in a pastry crust appear in print on this side of the Atlantic. Even then, as Ott persuasively argues, it would not be until well into the nineteenth century that pumpkin pie would take its canonical place at the end of the Thanksgiving meal. Before then, pumpkin was more likely to appear on the table in beer than for dessert.

Unexpected details like these are among the special pleasures of Cindy Ott’s book, but they serve a much deeper and more important purpose for her larger argument. Pumpkins contribute to modern American culture not just as pies but as jack-o’-lanterns. I will leave to Ott the strange tale of how Washington Irving’s famous Legend of Sleepy Hollow helped the pumpkin become as canonical to American Halloween as it is to American Thanksgiving—even though the pumpkin hurled at Ichabod Crane by the headless horseman in that story was just an ordinary vegetable with no carved face on it at all. But the jack-o’-lantern is an especially striking example of a lesson that Ott wants us to remember not just about pumpkins, but about all the other nonhuman organisms that touch our lives, whether the primary uses we make of them are for food or fiber or fuel or anything else. Such organisms, she insists, are not just material objects but cultural icons. They are freighted with human meanings. If we think of them only as food, and if we imagine that the value of such food consists solely of the profits it earns or the nutrients it supplies, we’ll miss much of what is most interesting about it, for it nourishes our minds and hearts as much as it does our bodies.
Today, American farmers grow more than a billion pounds of pumpkin worth more than a hundred million dollars each year. Since so much of that crop is devoted to the ritual celebrations associated with just two national holidays, it would be hard to find more striking proof that culture is just as important as ecology or economics if we truly wish to understand changing human relationships with the natural environment. In their very different ways, both the jack-o’-lantern and the pumpkin pie serve in the modern United States as symbols of the pastoral harvest, of food that, despite all the industrialization and technological manipulation it has endured, still has deep roots in the farm fields to which so many American families make pilgrimages when they purchase pumpkins each October. The desire to sustain such rituals has equally deep roots in American popular culture. This outsized orange vegetable is now a symbol of America’s rural past—even if what we believe it says about that past has as much to do with myth as with history. Pumpkin: The Curious History of an American Icon shows how a plant that we ignore for most of the year is all the more important to the popular culture of the United States and to the imaginations of its citizens precisely because we pay attention to it so occasionally. By reencountering it at harvest time, we remind ourselves of where we come from—though, as Cindy Ott so playfully reveals, the story of where we come from, like that of the pumpkin itself, is a good deal more complicated than we think.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

One of the great pleasures of researching and writing about pumpkins is that so many people have had a story to contribute. Studying the topic has introduced me to a wide range of wonderful people and interesting places, from midwestern pumpkin farmers to custodians of rare plant dictionaries, and from the humblest of produce auctions to the most prestigious university libraries. I would first like to thank my dissertation committee members at the University of Pennsylvania’s American Civilization Program, including Robert St. George, Mel Hammerberg, Christa Wilmann-Wells, and Janet Theophano, not only for their support and guidance but also for their unfailing interest in my general well-being during the earliest phases of this project. Professors Anne Spirn and Elizabeth Johns were also important mentors and wonderful teachers. Bob and Anne have never hesitated to provide letters of support over the years. I am grateful to the University of Pennsylvania and the American Civilization Program for their financial assistance, including the University Fellowship and the Dissertation Fellowship.

For taking time out from their hectic farm schedules, I thank David Ackerman, Todd Butler, John Lewis, and Maureen Torrey—pumpkin producers all. Dave Newhauser, the production manager at Libby’s, graciously spent nearly a whole day with me, showing me both field and factory production at the height of packing season. That day was one of the highlights of my research. I thank Mike Badgerow of Morton, Illinois, Ned Harden of Circleville, Ohio, and Vera Edwards of Spring Hope, North Carolina, who kindly shared their experiences and enthusiasm for their respective hometown pumpkin festivals. My sincere thanks to Gary Lucier, agricultural economist at the USDA, and Raymond J. Samulis, county agent, professor, and county department head, Cooperative Extension of Burlington County, New Jersey Agricultural Extension Station, for
their assistance in helping me with facts relating to the production and business of pumpkins. Finally, Maryland farmer David Heisler has helped guide my interest and developing expertise in picking and selling pumpkins from the beginning. He and his family are both mentors and dear friends.

When I was not out in the field investigating pumpkins during the early years of my research, I was probably at the Smithsonian Institution. My pre-doctoral fellowship gave me access to the institution’s fabulous resources and allowed me to touch base with old friends from my years working at the Archives of American Art and Department of Anthropology. Rayna Green, Charlie McGovern, Pete Daniel, John Fleckner, and Bruce Smith provided much support and guidance, along with my close friends Liza Kirwin, Karen Weiss, Peggy Feerick, Darcy Tell, Matt Wray, and Judy Throm. Anyone who knew and worked with Garnett McCoy at the Archives of American Art knows what a special privilege that was. His admirable mix of great intelligence, thoughtful insight, and lack of pretense is a model to us all. I want to thank the kind and helpful librarians at the National Agriculture Library, especially Sarah Lee, and the Library of Congress’s Rare Book and Special Collections Reading Room staff. I also thank Karl and Sarah Struble and the Circleville clan for their care and assistance. Thanks to my friends at the environmental nonprofit Rachel’s Network—Winsome McIntosh, Thu Pham, Elaine Broadhead, and Irene Crowe—who cheered me on while I worked on the first draft of this book, and to Axel Jansen, who was a great companion in and outside academia.

Some of the most important influences of my academic career and the best friends I’ve ever had resulted from my time at Yale University. My professors John Demos, Howard Lamar, Harvey Weiss, and Bill Cronon (more on Cronon later) continue to inspire. Peggy Burns, Phil Deloria, Marsha Hoem, Gunther Peck, Gul Pulhan, Carlo Rotella, Sam Truett, and Louis Warren are some of kindest and most creative people I know. Gunther had a particularly strong hand in getting this manuscript to publication by commenting on an early version and by supporting my career with letters of recommendation. Jenny Price, Tamar Besson, Emily Greenwald, Laura Katzman, and Sabine Zubragel generously offered their great advice, humor, and encouragement throughout the writing process and the rest of life’s trials and tribulations; they are like family to me. Any
success I have in producing engaging prose with a strong point I owe to Jenny, who has been a devoted reader and critic of all of my work. A special thanks to Jeff O’Toole, who means the world to me.

At each step in my career, I have been fortunate to make wonderful friends of my talented colleagues. At Montana State University and the Museum of the Rockies, these include Rob Campbell, Aiden Downey, Jody Rasker, Deborah Schuerr, Brett Walker, and Yanna Yannakakis. Jack Horner has always made me feel as special as one of his dinosaur finds, and he is as important to me as a golden pumpkin. There is no person I have more fun with on the back roads of Montana, or anywhere else for that matter, than Bill Yellowtail. It is one of life’s gifts that I can call him my friend.

A year as a visiting assistant professor in the history department at the University of Nevada–Las Vegas offered unimaginable creative inspiration in a city that surprised me. Special thanks to the talented Joerg Lemke, Brigitte Hoffman, Anatoli Akerman, Santa Fe and the Fat City Horns, and Michael Grimm. At UNLV, I thank Andy Kirk, Gene Moehring, and the National Park Service’s Dave Louter. Thanks to Elizabeth Nelson for her shared interest in cooking, eating, and talking about food and, along with Ethan, Phoebe, Cyrus, Jasper, and Chance, for immediately making their wonderful home like my own.

At Saint Louis University’s American Studies department, I have the most remarkable colleagues anyone could hope for. Matt Mancini, Susanne Wiedemann, Ben Looker, and Jonathan Smith produce thoughtful work, cheer each other’s successes, and laugh at each other’s jokes. They, especially Matt and Susanne, were invaluable in helping me get this book to press. I would also like to thank my graduate assistants Mark Koschmann, Rebecca Odom, and Melissa Ford. I am grateful for the SLU Mellon Faculty Development Grants that supported my summer writing and research, and international conference presentations; and to the SLU College of Arts and Sciences, which generously funded the book’s illustrations.

Although I rarely see them outside academic conferences, my times with Paul Sutter, Thomas Andrews, Ann Vileisis, and especially Neil Maher are a highlight of my year. Catching up with Christof Mauch as he dashes around the world is always a special pleasure. I have him to thank for my Fulbright and for many great times together discussing work and
all else. I thank Donald Worster for inviting me to present a book chapter at the Kansas University Nature-Culture Seminar in 2009 and for being not only a great role model for all historians but also really good company. I also want to add a word of appreciation to Michael Pollan, whose work has been so inspirational.

I am grateful to the folks at the Weyerhaeuser Environmental Books series for so enthusiastically caring for my manuscript at every stage of the process. Thanks to Julidta Tarver for accepting it and for then handing it off to Marianne Keddington-Lang, whose talent, critical eye, and level of good cheer are unsurpassed and much appreciated. A special thanks to Warren Belasco for his sharp yet supportive review of the manuscript. Thanks to Tim Zimmerman for his assistance with the many illustrations and to Jane Kepp for her great copyediting. It was a long time ago, during a seminar at Yale, that Bill Cronon first inspired me to think about writing history as creating compelling and engaging stories that make people question their assumptions. His commitment to bringing the study of history outdoors, beyond the classroom and library stacks, made history more fun. It also encouraged me to see the field as an exploration not simply of the past but of the world around us today. His integrity and friendly disposition are unmatched. It is a thrill to have my book as a part of his series, for personal as well as professional reasons. For all of the above, I am very grateful to Bill.

As the youngest of four sisters, I am showered with words of wisdom and unconditional support. Much love and thanks to my sisters Susan, Judy, and Debi, and to my nieces Kirsten, Jennifer, Jessica, and Lauren, my grandniece Maira, my brothers-in-law Bruce, Gregers, Robert, and Wolfgang, my nieces’ partners Marco and Knut, and the Swarr family. They didn’t always know what I was doing, exactly, but they always offered their love and encouragement. For their devotion, hours of great company on trail walks, and patience while I finished one more sentence, I am grateful to Sam, Georgia, Rain Dog, Shiloh, and Lola.

I will always be thankful to James Barter and Pamela Cobb, who made this book possible in the most basic way.

Finally, I dedicate this book to the person whose intelligence, imagination, determination, and love are the guiding inspirations to me for all my life—my mother, Dorothy Welch Ott (1918–1994).
INTRODUCTION

IN THE FALL OF 1995 I HELPED A FRIEND, DAVID HEISLER, SELL PUMPKINS IN FRONT OF HIS FARMHOUSE IN COMUS, MARYLAND—MORE A CROSSTROADS THAN A TOWN—ABOUT FORTY MILES NORTHWEST OF WASHINGTON, D.C. Heisler had grown up on a nearby dairy farm that had since been sold to developers and divided into large estates. Intent on keeping his tractor a useful piece of equipment instead of merely a yard ornament, he raised fruits and vegetables on a couple of acres adjacent to his house and on fields near his boyhood home just down the road. In the summers, without any fanfare, he dropped off peppers, green beans, and corn at the local Safeway grocery store for resale. Later in the season, the piles of pumpkins he set around his yard amid crates of local apples, Indian corn, and colorful squash became an autumn spectacle. His pumpkin stand drew crowds of thousands every weekend in October. From about ten in the morning until sunset, carloads of visitors wandered the pumpkin patch. They playfully held up specimens of different sizes and shapes for their companions’ inspection and took pictures in the middle of the patch before leaving with armloads of pumpkins and bags of other fall produce.

After my immersion in the pageantry of the pumpkin stand for five weekends in a row, I no longer just walked, drove, or turned magazine pages past pumpkins but rather stopped, stared, and wondered what the fuss was all about. I thought not only about the crowds flocking to the fall stands but also about the time-honored pumpkin pie at Thanksgiving dinner. Unlike most people around the world, who eat pumpkin unceremoniously throughout the year, Americans eat it hardly at all, except at this one national holiday feast. Instead of eating fresh pumpkins, they set them in front of their houses as decorations every autumn and carve them into jack-o’-lanterns for Halloween night. Small towns across the country hold annual festivals named in the pumpkin’s honor, though few have